




Accurate Programming
Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing
June 3-5, 2013

Testing and Verification in ACL2

Rex Page, University of Oklahoma
14:00 - 15:30

Support provided by   

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Goal

software that meets expectations

Specifying expectations

- ✓ suite of test cases
 - input, expected output (operation x^2): $2^2 = 4, 3^2 = 9$
- ✓ corner cases
 - carefully chosen input, expected output: $(-1)^2 = 1$
- ✓ operator relationships
 - Boolean formulas: $x^2 \geq 0, (x + y)^2 = x^2 + 2xy + y^2, \dots$

Tests are theorems

- ✓ test cases: theorems with one-element domains
- ✓ operator relationships: more general theorems
- ✓ type checking: theorems proved by compilers

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Theorems are derived from axioms

axioms

- $x + 0 = x$ {+ identity}
- $(-x) + x = 0$ {+ complement}
- $x \times 1 = x$ {× identity}
- $x \times 0 = 0$ {× null}
- $x + y = y + x$ {+ commutative}
- $x + (y + z) = (x + y) + z$ {+ associative}
- $x \times (y + z) = (x \times y) + (x \times z)$ {distributive law}

x, y, z stand for any formula

Software verification

✓ axioms = programs
✓ theorems = properties of programs

Software framework

✓ programs = systems of equations
✓ constrains programs, but not computations

theorem: $(-1) \times (-1) = 1$

derivation

$$\begin{aligned} & (-1) \times (-1) && \{+ \text{id}\} \\ & = ((-1) \times (-1)) + 0 && \{+ \text{comp}\} \\ & = ((-1) \times (-1)) + ((-1) + 1) && \{+ \text{assoc}\} \\ & = (((-1) \times (-1)) + (-1)) + 1 && \{× \text{id}\} \\ & = ((-1) \times ((-1) + 1)) + 1 && \{\text{dist law}\} \\ & = ((-1) \times 0) + 1 && \{+ \text{comp}\} \\ & = 0 + 1 && \{× \text{null}\} \\ & = 1 + 0 && \{+ \text{comm}\} \\ & = 1 && \{+ \text{id}\} \end{aligned}$$

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Some operations on lists (informal specs)

algebra of software

- $(\text{cons } x [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = [x x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]$
- $(\text{first } [x_1 x_2 \dots x_{n+1}]) = x_1$
- $(\text{rest } [x_1 x_2 \dots x_{n+1}]) = [x_2 \dots x_{n+1}]$
- $(\text{append } [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n] [y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]) = [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]$
- $(\text{len } [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = n$

Axioms (equations of computation ... "programs")

- $(\text{first } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs})) = x$ {first}
- $(\text{rest } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs})) = \text{xs}$ {rest}
- $(\text{append nil ys}) = \text{ys}$ {app0}
- $(\text{append } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs}) \text{ ys}) = (\text{cons } x (\text{append } \text{xs } \text{ys}))$ {app1}
- $(\text{len nil}) = 0$ {len0}
- $(\text{len } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs})) = 1 + (\text{len } \text{xs})$ {len1}

Theorems (properties derivable from axioms)

- $(\text{append } \text{xs } (\text{append } \text{ys } \text{zs})) = (\text{append } (\text{append } \text{xs } \text{ys}) \text{zs})$ {app-assoc}
- $(\text{len } (\text{append } \text{xs } \text{ys})) = (\text{len } \text{xs}) + (\text{len } \text{ys})$ {app-len}

Tests are all you need

Axioms, programs, properties ... all can be formulated as tests

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Properties (tests) that act as definitions

Two properties of concatenation

- $(\text{append nil ys}) = \text{ys}$ {app0}
- $(\text{append } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs}) \text{ ys}) = (\text{cons } x (\text{append } \text{xs } \text{ys}))$ {app1}

These equations have the following attributes

- ✓ comprehensive — all cases covered by left-hand-side formulas
- ✓ consistent — no two equations specify conflicting results
- ✓ computational

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Properties (tests) that act as definitions

Two properties of concatenation

- $(\text{append nil ys}) = \text{ys}$ {app0}
- $(\text{append } (\text{cons } x \text{ xs}) \text{ ys}) = (\text{cons } x (\text{append } \text{xs } \text{ys}))$ {app1}

These equations have the following attributes

- ✓ comprehensive — all cases covered
- ✓ consistent — no two equations specify conflicting results
- ✓ computational

circular reference on right-hand-side of equation closer to non-circular case than reference on left-hand-side

Third Halmstad Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013

Properties (tests) that act as definitions

Two properties of concatenation
 $(\text{append nil } ys) = ys$ {app0}
 $(\text{append } (\text{cons } x \text{ } xs) \text{ } ys) = (\text{cons } x \text{ } (\text{append } xs \text{ } ys))$ {app1}

These equations have the following attributes

- ✓ **comprehensive** — all cases covered
- ✓ **consistent** — no two equations specify conflicting results
- ✓ **computational**
circular reference on right-hand-side of equation closer to non-circular case than reference on left-hand-side

the 3 c's

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 7

Properties (tests) that act as definitions

Two properties of concatenation
 $(\text{append nil } ys) = ys$ {app0}
 $(\text{append } (\text{cons } x \text{ } xs) \text{ } ys) = (\text{cons } x \text{ } (\text{append } xs \text{ } ys))$ {app1}

These equations have the following attributes

- ✓ **comprehensive** — all cases covered
- ✓ **consistent** — no two equations specify conflicting results
- ✓ **computational**
circular reference on right-hand-side of equation closer to non-circular case than reference on left-hand-side

the 3 c's

Equations satisfying "the 3 c's" define an operator

- ✓ all properties of the operation derive from the equations
- ✓ including computational properties

Formal definition of concatenation (ACL2 syntax)

```
(defun append (xs ys)
  (if (consp xs) ; cons predicate: Is xs a cons?
      (cons (first xs) (append (rest xs) ys)) ; {app1}
      ys ; {app0})
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 8

What is ACL2 ?

ACL2 — A Computational Logic for Applicative Common Lisp

- ✓ programming language and mechanized logic
dialect of Common Lisp
conservative logic for effective mechanization/automation
1st-order logic, terminating functions, no mutable variables
- ✓ Boyer/Moore theorem-prover, latest edition
40 years in the making
Many commercial applications (AMD, Rockwell-Collins, NSA ...)

Proof Pad — IDE for ACL2 (Eggensperger)

- ✓ programming + theorem proving = full ACL2
- ✓ + property-based testing
... but no narrowing, no user-defined data generators
- ✓ other ACL2 IDEs
Emacs (comes with ACL2 installation: Moore, Kaufmann)
DrACuLA (DrRacket plug-in: PLT, Felleisen, Eastlund)
ACL2 Sedan (Eclipse plug-in: Manolios, Dillinger, Vroon ...)

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 9

Formal specifications of properties (Proof Pad)

Some expected properties (informal specs)

```
(append xs (append ys zs)) = (append (append xs ys) zs) {app-assoc}
(len (append xs ys)) = (len xs) + (len ys) {app-len}
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 10

Formal specifications of properties (Proof Pad)

```
(append xs (append ys zs)) = (append (append xs ys) zs) {app-assoc}
(len (append xs ys)) = (len xs) + (len ys) informal {app-len}
```

formal property

```
(defproperty app-assoc-tst ; {app-assoc}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   zs : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (append xs (append ys zs))
         (append (append xs ys) zs)))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 11

Formal specifications of properties (Proof Pad)

```
(append xs (append ys zs)) = (append (append xs ys) zs) {app-assoc}
(len (append xs ys)) = (len xs) + (len ys) informal {app-len}
```

formal properties (Proof Pad)

```
(defproperty app-assoc-tst ; {app-assoc}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   zs : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (append xs (append ys zs))
         (append (append xs ys) zs)))

(defproperty append-preserves-len-tst: {app-len}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (= (len (append xs ys)) (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 12

Formal specifications of properties (Proof Pad)

```
(append xs (append ys zs)) = (append (append xs ys) zs) {app-assoc}
(len (append xs ys)) = (len xs) + (len ys) informal {app-len}
```

formal properties (Proof Pad)

```
(defproperty app-assoc-tst ; {app-assoc}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   zs : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (append xs (append ys zs))
         (append (append xs ys) zs)))
```

demo 1

```
(defproperty append-preserves-len-tst; {app-len}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (= (len (append xs ys)) (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
```

13

Formal specifications of theorems (ACL2)

```
(append xs (append ys zs)) = (append (append xs ys) zs) {app-assoc}
(len (append xs ys)) = (len xs) + (len ys) informal {app-len}
```

properties (Proof Pad)

```
(defproperty app-assoc-tst ; {app-assoc}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   zs : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (append xs (append ys zs))
         (append (append xs ys) zs)))
```

demo 2

```
(defthm app-assoc-thm ; {app-assoc}
  (equal (append xs (append ys zs))
         (append (append xs ys) zs)))
```

theorems (ACL2)

```
(defproperty append-preserves-len-tst; {app-len}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (= (len (append xs ys)) (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
```

```
(defthm append-preserves-len-thm; {app-len}
  (= (len (append xs ys)) (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
```

14

Additional properties of concatenation

```
(defproperty app-suffix-tst ; {app-sfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (nthcdr (len xs) (append xs ys))
         ys))
```

```
(defproperty app-prefix-tst ; {app-pfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (prefix (len xs) (append xs ys))
         xs))
```

Axioms defining prefix operator

```
(prefix 0 xs) = nil {pfx0 a}
(prefix n nil) = nil {pfx0 b}
(prefix (+ n 1) (cons x xs)) = (cons x (prefix n xs)) {pfx1}
```

15

Additional properties of concatenation

```
(defproperty app-suffix-tst ; {app-sfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (nthcdr (len xs) (append xs ys))
         ys))
```

```
(defproperty app-prefix-tst ; {app-pfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (prefix (len xs) (append xs ys))
         xs))
```

Axioms defining prefix operator

```
(prefix 0 xs) = nil {pfx0 a}
(prefix n nil) = nil {pfx0 b}
(prefix (+ n 1) (cons x xs)) = (cons x (prefix n xs)) {pfx1}
```

16

Additional properties of concatenation

```
; import some theorems of algebra
(include-book "arithmetic-3/top" :dir :system)
(defproperty app-suffix-tst ; {app-sfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (nthcdr (len xs) (append xs ys))
         ys))
```

```
(defproperty app-prefix-tst ; {app-pfx}
  (xs : value (random-list-of (random-integer))
   :where (true-listp xs) ; xs must be list
   ys : value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (prefix (len xs) (append xs ys))
         xs))
```

```
(defthm append-prefix-thm ; {app-pfx}
  (implies (true-listp xs) ; xs must be a list
            (equal (prefix (len xs) (append xs ys))
                   xs)))
```

theorem becomes implication with :where-condition as hypothesis

17

Mechanization Is Necessary

without it, all is lost in the details

Even simple properties lead to big proofs

- ✓ millions of details in proofs about big programs
 - People can't keep track of millions of details
 - Besides, a proof at least is as likely to be wrong as a program
- ✓ people formulate properties ... computers push details
 - proof organized into lemmas — similar to software components
 - rigorous, but not fully formal
 - like a paper-and-pencil proof, as done by mathematicians
 - some lemma architectures are better than others
 - like modular decomposition of software ... design matters
 - formulation of properties is a big task
 - experience/judgment required ... as in software development

Same strategy for testing

- ✓ formulate, then automate

18

Things that have been done with ACL2

AMD Athlon (K7) floating point processor (1999)

- ✓ AMD floating-point division circuit verified after 1994/97 Pentium floating-point division bugs
- ✓ Property verified
(implies (and (floating-point-numberp p 15 64)
(floating-point-numberp d 15 64)
(not (equal d 0))
(rounding-modep mode))
(equal (divide p d mode)
(round (/ p d) mode))))...

Other commercial applications

- Motorola DSP microcode
- Rockwell Collins AAMP7 avionics software ... ongoing
- Centaur VLSI chip design ... ongoing
- Numerous NSA applications ... ongoing

High-assurance software and circuits

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 19

Test suites versus proofs

Testing

- ✓ AMD floating-point
AMD test suite of 80-million cases
gazillions of cases to consider ($2^{15 \times 64} \times 2^{15 \times 64} = 2^{158}$)
physically impossible to do that many tests

Proofs cover all cases

Extra investment for proof is substantial

- ✓ justified in some applications, but not all
- ✓ property-based testing justified in most applications

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 20

Practice exercises (20 minutes)

Ex 1: insert element at the end of a list

Suppose snoc inserts an element at the end of a list
(snoc x [x₁ x₂ ... x_n]) = [x₁ x₂ ... x_n x]

- Complete the following equations
(snoc x nil) = ?? {snoc0}
(snoc x [x₁ x₂ ... x_{n+1}]) = ?? {snoc1} (use circular reference)
- Define snoc formally (that is, in ACL2)

Ex 2: reverse a list

Use snoc to define a list reversal operator in ACL2
(rev [x₁ x₂ ... x_{n+1} x_n]) = [x_n x_{n-1} ... x₂ x₁]

Ex 3: properties of reverse

- Define/test a property of the formula (rev (rev xs))
- Define/test a property of (rev (append xs ys))
- Use ACL2 to verify (prove) those properties

Download Proof Pad: <http://proofpad.org>

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 21

Multiplexor - informal specification

(mux [x₁ x₂ x₃ ...] [y₁ y₂ y₃ ...]) = [x₁ y₁ x₂ y₂ x₃ y₃ ...]

Definitional properties of mux

(mux nil [y₁ ... y_m]) = ??
(mux [x₁ ... x_n] nil) = ??
(mux [x₁ ... x_{n+1}] [y₁ ... y_{m+1}]) = ??

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 22

Multiplexor - informal specification

(mux [x₁ x₂ x₃ ...] [y₁ y₂ y₃ ...]) = [x₁ y₁ x₂ y₂ x₃ y₃ ...]

Definitional properties of mux

the 3 c's
(mux nil [y₁ ... y_m]) = [y₁ ... y_m]
(mux [x₁ ... x_n] nil) = [x₁ ... x_n]
(mux [x₁ ... x_{n+1}] [y₁ ... y_{m+1}]) = [x₁ y₁ ... ?? ...]

(mux [x₂ ... x_{n+1}] [y₂ ... y_{m+1}])

Formal definition (ACL2)

```
(defun mux (xs ys)
  (if (not (consp xs))
      ys ; mux0
      (if (not (consp ys))
          xs ; mux10
          (cons (first xs) (cons (first ys)
                                (mux (rest xs) (rest ys)))))) ; mux11
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 23

Demultiplexor - informal specification

(dmx [x₁ x₂ x₃ ...] = [[x₁ x₃ x₅ ...] [x₂ x₄ x₆ ...]]

Some properties of dmx

(dmx nil) = [nil nil]
(dmx [x₂ ... x_{n+1}]) = [[x₂ x₄ x₆ ...] [x₃ x₅ x₇ ...]]
= [odds evns] *the 3 c's*
(dmx [x₁ x₂ ... x_{n+1}]) = [(cons x₁ odds) evns]

Formal definition (ACL2)

```
(defun dmx (xys)
  (if (consp xys)
      (let* ((x (first xys))
             (ysxs (dmx (rest xys)))
             (ys (first ysxs))
             (xs (second ysxs)))
        (list (cons x xs) ys)) ; dmx1
      (list xys xys)) ; dmx0
```

eh?

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 24

Expectations - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

Length preservation

```
(defthm dmx-preserves-length-thm
  (= (len xys)
     (+ (len (first (dmx xys)))
        (len (second (dmx xys))))))

(defthm mux-preserves-length-thm
  (= (len (mux xs ys))
     (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 25

Expectations - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

Conservation of elements

```
(defthm dmx-conserves-of-elements-thm
  (iff (member-equal e xys)
       (or (member-equal e (first (dmx xys)))
           (member-equal e (second (dmx xys))))))

(defthm mux-conserves-of-elements-thm
  (iff (member-equal e (mux xs ys))
       (or (member-equal e xs)
           (member-equal e ys))))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 26

Round-trip properties - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

mux inverts dmx

```
(defproperty mux-inverts-dmx-tst
  (xys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (mux (first (dmx xys))
             (second (dmx xys)))
         xys))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 27

Round-trip properties - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

mux inverts dmx

```
(defproperty mux-inverts-dmx-tst
  (xys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (mux (first (dmx xys))
             (second (dmx xys)))
         xys))
```

dmx inverts mux

```
(defproperty dmx-inverts-mux-tst
  (xs :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (ys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (dmx (mux xs ys))
         (list xs ys)))
```

demo 3

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 28

Round-trip properties - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

mux inverts dmx

```
(defproperty mux-inverts-dmx-tst
  (xys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (mux (first (dmx xys))
             (second (dmx xys)))
         xys))
```

dmx inverts mux

```
(defproperty dmx-inverts-mux-tst
  (xs :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (ys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (dmx (mux xs ys))
         (list xs ys)))
```

demo 3 whoops!

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 29

Round-trip properties - mux, dmx

```
(mux [x1 x2 x3 ...] [y1 y2 y3 ...]) = [x1 y1 x2 y2 x3 y3 ...]
(dmx [x1 x2 x3 ...]) = [[x1 x3 x5 ...] [x2 x4 x6 ...]]
```

mux inverts dmx

```
(defproperty mux-inverts-dmx-tst
  (xys :value (random-list-of (random-integer)))
  (equal (mux (first (dmx xys))
             (second (dmx xys)))
         xys))
```

dmx inverts mux

```
(defproperty dmx-inverts-mux-tst
  (n :value (random-natural))
  (xs :value (random-integer-list-of-length n))
  (ys :value (random-integer-list-of-length n))
  (implies (and (true-listp xs) (true-listp ys))
            (= (len xs) (len ys)))
  (equal (dmx (mux xs ys))
         (list xs ys)))
```

demo 3B

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 30

Ordered merge — informal spec —

$$(mrg [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n] [y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_{n+m}]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_{n+m}$ if
if $x_1 \leq x_2 \leq \dots \leq x_n$ and $y_1 \leq y_2 \leq \dots \leq y_m$

definitional properties of mrg

$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ x\ (mrg\ xs\ (cons\ y\ ys)))$	{x<y}
$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ y\ (mrg\ (cons\ x\ xs)\ ys))$	{y<x}
$(mrg\ xs\ nil) = xs$	{mg0}
$(mrg\ nil\ ys) = ys$	{mg1}

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 31

Ordered merge — informal spec —

$$(mrg [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n] [y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_{n+m}]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_{n+m}$ if
if $x_1 \leq x_2 \leq \dots \leq x_n$ and $y_1 \leq y_2 \leq \dots \leq y_m$

definitional properties of mrg

$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ x\ (mrg\ xs\ (cons\ y\ ys)))$	{x<y}
$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ y\ (mrg\ (cons\ x\ xs)\ ys))$	{y<x}
$(mrg\ xs\ nil) = xs$	{mg0}
$(mrg\ nil\ ys) = ys$	{mg1}

formal definition

```
(defun mrg (xs ys)
  (if (and (consp xs) (consp ys))
      (let* ((x (first xs)) (y (first ys)))
        (if (<= x y)
            (cons x (mrg (rest xs) ys)) ; {mgx}
            (cons y (mrg xs (rest ys)))) ; {mgy}
      (if (not (consp ys))
          (cons xs (cons nil ys)) ; {mg0}
          (cons nil xs) ; {mg1})))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 32

Ordered merge — informal spec —

$$(mrg [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n] [y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_{n+m}]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_{n+m}$ if
if $x_1 \leq x_2 \leq \dots \leq x_n$ and $y_1 \leq y_2 \leq \dots \leq y_m$

definitional properties of mrg

$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ x\ (mrg\ xs\ (cons\ y\ ys)))$	{x<y}
$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ y\ (mrg\ (cons\ x\ xs)\ ys))$	{y<x}
$(mrg\ xs\ nil) = xs$	{mg0}
$(mrg\ nil\ ys) = ys$	{mg1}

additional expectations

```
(defthm mrg-preserves-order-thm
  (implies (and (up xs) (up ys))
            (up (mrg xs ys))))
```

$(up [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = x_1 \leq x_2 \leq \dots \leq x_n$

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 33

Ordered merge — informal spec —

$$(mrg [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n] [y_1 y_2 \dots y_m]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_{n+m}]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_{n+m}$ if
if $x_1 \leq x_2 \leq \dots \leq x_n$ and $y_1 \leq y_2 \leq \dots \leq y_m$

definitional properties of mrg

$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ x\ (mrg\ xs\ (cons\ y\ ys)))$	{x<y}
$(mrg (cons\ x\ xs) (cons\ y\ ys)) = (cons\ y\ (mrg\ (cons\ x\ xs)\ ys))$	{y<x}
$(mrg\ xs\ nil) = xs$	{mg0}
$(mrg\ nil\ ys) = ys$	{mg1}

additional expectations

```
(defthm mrg-preserves-order-thm
  (implies (and (up xs) (up ys))
            (up (mrg xs ys))))
(defthm mrg-conservation-of-values-thm
  (iff (member-equal e (mrg xs ys))
       (or (member-equal e xs) (member-equal e ys))))
(up [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = x_1 \le x_2 \le \dots \le x_n
(member-equal x [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = (x=x_1) or (x=x_2) or ... or (x=x_n)
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 34

Merge-sort — informal spec —

$$(msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_n]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_n$
and $[z_1 z_2 \dots z_n]$ is a permutation of $[x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]$

definitional properties of merge-sort

$(msort []) = []$	{ms0}
$(msort [x]) = [x]$	{ms1}
$(msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = (mrg (msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor}] (msort [x_{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor + 1} \dots x_n])))$	{ms2}

additional expectations

```
(defthm msort-order-thm
  (up (msort xs)))
(defthm msort-conservation-of-values-thm
  (iff (member-equal e (msort xs))
       (member-equal e xs)))
```

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 35

Merge-sort — informal spec —

$$(msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = [z_1 z_2 \dots z_n]$$

where $z_1 \leq z_2 \leq \dots \leq z_n$
and $[z_1 z_2 \dots z_n]$ is a permutation of $[x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]$

definitional properties of merge-sort

$(msort []) = []$	{ms0}
$(msort [x]) = [x]$	{ms1}
$(msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_n]) = (mrg (msort [x_1 x_2 \dots x_{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor}] (msort [x_{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor + 1} \dots x_n])))$	{ms2}

additional expectations

```
(defthm msort-order-thm
  (up (msort xs)))
(defthm msort-conservation-of-values-thm
  (iff (member-equal e (msort xs))
       (member-equal e xs)))
```

demo 4

any split putting half of the elements in one list and half in the other is okay

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 36

Ordered merge informal spec

(mrg [x₁ x₂... x_n] [y₁ y₂ ... y_m]) = [z₁ z₂ ... z_{n+m}]
 where z₁ ≤ z₂ ≤ ... ≤ z_{n+m} if
 if x₁ ≤ x₂ ≤ ... ≤ x_n and y₁ ≤ y₂ ≤ ... ≤ y_m

definitional properties of mrg

```
(mrg (cons x xs) (cons y ys)) = (cons x (mrg xs (cons y ys))) {x<y}
(mrg (cons x xs) (cons y ys)) = (cons y (mrg (cons x xs) ys)) {y<x}
(mrg xs nil) = xs {mg0}
(mrg nil ys) = ys {mg1}
(defun mrg (xs ys)
  (declare (xargs :measure (+ (len xs) (len ys))))
  (if (and (consp xs) (consp ys))
      (let* ((x (first xs)) (y (first ys))
            (if (<= x y)
                (cons x (mrg (rest xs) (cons y ys))) ; {mgx}
                (cons y (mrg xs (rest ys))) ; {mgy}
            (if (not (consp ys))
                xs ; {mg0}
                ys))) ; {mg1}
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 37
```

formal definition (vertical text on left)

suggested induction scheme (diagonal text)

demo 4B (red text)

Merge-sort

formal definition of merge-sort

```
(defun msort (xs)
  (if (consp (rest xs)) ; (len xs) > 1?
      (let* ((odds-evens (dmx xs)) ; xs = [x1 x2 ...]
            (odds (first odds-evens))
            (evns (second odds-evens)))
          (mrg (msort odds) (msort evns))) ; {ms2}
      xs) ; xs = [x1] or empty {ms1}
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 38
```

Merge-sort

formal definition of merge-sort

```
(defun msort (xs)
  (if (consp (rest xs)) ; (len xs) > 1?
      (let* ((odds-evens (dmx xs)) ; xs = [x1 x2 ...]
            (odds (first odds-evens))
            (evns (second odds-evens)))
          (mrg (msort odds) (msort evns))) ; {ms2}
      xs) ; xs = [x1] or empty {ms1}
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 39
```

maybe it doesn't know dmx reduces the list length

```
(defthm dmx-reduces-len-thm : lemma, msort termination
  (implies (consp (rest xs))
    (and (< (len (first (dmx xs))) (len xs))
         (< (len (second (dmx xs))) (len xs)))))
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 39
```

Merge-sort

formal definition of merge-sort

```
(defun msort (xs)
  (declare ; suggest using lemma to prove termination
    (xargs :measure (len xs)
          :hints (("Goal"
                    :use ((:instance dmx-reduces-len-thm))))))
  (if (consp (rest xs)) ; (len xs) > 1?
      (let* ((odds-evens (dmx xs)) ; xs = [x1 x2 ...]
            (odds (first odds-evens))
            (evns (second odds-evens)))
          (mrg (msort odds) (msort evns))) ; {ms2}
      xs) ; xs = [x1] or empty {ms1}
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 40
```

maybe it doesn't know dmx reduces the list length

```
(defthm dmx-reduces-len-thm : lemma, msort termination
  (implies (consp (rest xs))
    (and (< (len (first (dmx xs))) (len xs))
         (< (len (second (dmx xs))) (len xs)))))
    Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 40
```

demo 4C (red text)

Practice exercises (30 minutes)

Linear Encoding

Define operators to encode and decode lists of natural numbers within a given range, and verify that decode inverts encode

Encode
The encoding process adds adjacent numbers in the input list, modulo the given range

Decode
Inverse of encode

Project description
<http://blog.accurate-programming.org/>

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 41

The End

June 4, 2013
14:00-15:30 session

Third Halmstead Summer School on Testing June 2-5, 2013 42